

1.3 Using Reasoning to Find a Counterexample to a Conjecture

When students make a conjecture, they will attempt to either prove their conjecture by constructing a valid argument or they may disprove their conjecture by finding a **counterexample**. One counterexample is sufficient to disprove a conjecture.

Example 1:

To introduce this topic, students could be asked to come up with counterexamples for statements such as the following:

- (A) Any piece of furniture having four legs is a table.

False. A chair has 4 legs.

- (B) If something has a knob on it, it's a faucet.

False. A door has a knob.

- (C) If the grass is wet, it is raining.

False. Sprinkler may be on.

- (D) All students like sports.

False. Kamryn.

Use strategies, such as drawing pictures or using measuring instruments, when looking for a counterexample. After a counterexample is found, students should revise their conjecture to include the new evidence.

It is important to realize that not finding a counterexample does not prove the conjecture. You need to try ALL possible cases to prove a conjecture.

A mathematician named Goldbach is famous for discovering a conjecture which has not yet been proved to be true or false. Goldbach conjectured that every even number greater than 2 can be written as the sum of two prime numbers. For example, $4 = 2 + 2$, $6 = 3 + 3$, and $8 = 3 + 5$. No one has ever proved this conjecture to be true or found a counterexample to show that it is false, so the conjecture remains just that.

Example 2:

Provide a counterexample for each of the following conjectures:

- (A) If a number is divisible by 2, then it is divisible by 4.

$$\frac{10}{4} = 2.5 \quad \text{False.}$$

- (B) If $x + 4 > 0$, then x is positive.

$$\begin{aligned} -3 + 4 &> 0 && \text{False.} \\ 1 &> 0 \end{aligned}$$

- (C) For all positive numbers n , $\frac{1}{n} < n$.

$$\begin{aligned} n=2 \quad \frac{1}{2} < 2 &&& \frac{1}{1} \not< 1 \quad \text{False.} \\ n=3 \quad \frac{1}{3} < 3 &&& \\ n=4 \quad \frac{1}{4} < 4 &&& \end{aligned}$$

Example 3:

Respond to the following:

- (A) For all real numbers x , the expression x^2 is greater than or equal to x . Do you agree? Justify your answer.

No.

$$x=1 \quad 1^2 \geq 1$$

$$1 \geq 1 \checkmark$$

$$x=0 \quad 0^2 \geq 0$$

$$0 \geq 0 \checkmark$$

$$x=2 \quad 2^2 \geq 2$$

$$4 \geq 2 \checkmark$$

$$x=0.5 \quad (0.5)^2 \geq 0.5$$

$$0.25 \neq 0.5$$

$$x=-2 \quad (-2)^2 \geq -2$$

$$4 \geq -2$$

False.

- (B) If $x > 0$, then $\sqrt{x} < x$. Do you agree? Justify your answer.

$$x=1 \quad \sqrt{1} < 1$$

No

$$1 \nless 1$$

False.